

ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR EUROPE

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

109th meeting
Geneva, 17 February 2020

Item 5

Informal Document No. 2020/3

Annual report on evaluation 2019

Note by the Secretariat

INTRODUCTION

1. The present report is submitted to the Executive Committee (EXCOM) for information. EXCOM requested the Secretariat to prepare an annual report on evaluation at the ninety-first Meeting on 24 March 2017¹, beginning with an annual report for 2017. The purpose of the report is to inform the UNECE member States on evaluation efforts conducted during the past year, future evaluation plans, the status and information on completed, ongoing evaluations, and changes generated by the implementation of relevant recommendations.

2. As per the UNECE Evaluation Policy, the Secretariat undertakes evaluations for the purpose of learning, as well as to improve the future work of the organization. The present report consolidates and analyses the outcome of all evaluations conducted in 2019 in order to support this objective. The Executive Secretary, through the Programme Management Unit (PMU), ensures the consistent application of evaluation norms and standards across UNECE, and ensures the application of the key outcomes of evaluations into the future planning of the UNECE programme of work.

3. The analysis is based on the results of all evaluations conducted and/or commissioned by UNECE, relevant external and/or system-wide evaluations, and the UN System Wide Action Plan (UN-SWAP) to implement the Chief Executives Board for Coordination (CEB) Policy on gender equality and the empowerment of women.²

2. BACKGROUND ON EVALUATION IN THE UN SECRETARIAT

4. UNECE is governed by the Secretary-General's instructions for the UN Secretariat³, which outlines the requirements for evaluation for all departments. The purpose of evaluation is to determine as systematically and objectively as possible the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and impact of the Organization's activities in relation to their objectives, and to enable the Secretariat and Member States to engage in systematic reflection, and, if necessary, reviewing their objectives.⁴

5. To this end, all programmes shall be evaluated over a fixed time period, which shall include periodic self-evaluation of activities and the ad hoc in-depth evaluation of selected programme areas or topics.⁵ Evaluations may be conducted by external entities (the Office for Internal Oversight Services (OIOS), the Joint Inspection Unit (JIU), at the request of Member States), or by respective departments (so called "self-evaluation"). Self-evaluation shall be independent and assess the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and impact of subprogrammes and activities. Heads of departments are responsible for ensuring high quality results, rigorous evaluation methodology, transfer of evaluation information, and conduct of ad hoc studies.

¹ http://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/commission/EXCOM/Agenda/2017/92Excom-23_June_17/Item_2-Chair_s_conclusions-24.03.2017.pdf

² <https://undocs.org/CEB/2006/2>

³ ST/SGB/2018/3 Secretary-General's bulletin Regulations and Rules Governing Programme Planning, the Programme Aspects of the Budget, the Monitoring of Implementation and the Methods of Evaluation, 1 June 2018

⁴ ST/SGB/2018/3 Reg 7.1

⁵ ST/SGB/2018/3 Reg 7.2 and Rule 107.2

6. UNECE is an active member of the UN Evaluation Group (UNEG), which establishes the norms and standards for evaluation for all UN agencies, funds and programmes. OIOS produces a biennial Evaluation Dashboard which assesses the extent to which departments adhere to the UNEG norms and standards. Section 5.2.1 of this report provides additional information on the Evaluation Dashboard 2016-2017, released in April 2019.

7. The General Assembly resolution 72/279⁶ on repositioning the UN development system (UNDS), together with Assembly resolution 71/243⁷ on the quadrennial comprehensive policy review (QCPR) of operational activities for the United Nations system, called upon the entities of the UNDS to strengthen capacities, resources and skill sets to support national Governments in achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). The QCPR stressed the need to improve monitoring and reporting on system-wide results and welcomed the strengthening of independent system-wide evaluation measures by the Secretary-General.

8. Further to the QCPR, General Assembly resolution 73/289⁸ welcomed the efforts of the Secretary-General towards a strong culture of accountability throughout the Secretariat and stressed that an effective accountability system is central to successful management of the Organization. Recalling paragraph 16 of resolution 72/303, paragraph 17 of resolution 73/289 requested the Secretary-General to continue to take concrete measures to enhance in-house capacity for self-evaluation.

9. In compliance with the requests from the General Assembly, the Secretary-General initiated in September 2019 the preparation of a Secretary-General Bulletin (SGB) on Self-Evaluation Policy for the United Nations Secretariat. This Secretariat Policy will serve as the overarching framework for self-evaluation activities in the Secretariat, enhancing, supporting and encouraging a strong culture of evaluation as part of the programme management cycle.

3. KEY ACHIEVEMENTS

10. A total of 16 evaluations (programme, subprogramme and end of project) were delivered in 2019: 1 programme and 2 subprogramme level evaluations as contained in the Biennial Evaluation Plan (2018-2019) scheduled for 2019; 2 evaluations of UNDA projects, and 11 evaluations of extrabudgetary projects.

3.1 Implementation of outstanding evaluation recommendations from institutional-level evaluations

3.1.1 External evaluations

11. UNECE reports progress on closing outstanding evaluation recommendations to OIOS every six-months, and through the annual Compact of the Executive Secretary with the Secretary-General. All Progress Reports are available on the Open UNECE website. In 2019, UNECE was not subject to outstanding recommendations from OIOS evaluations, as all were closed at 31 December 2018.

⁶ <https://undocs.org/A/RES/72/279>

⁷ <https://undocs.org/A/RES/71/243>

⁸ <https://undocs.org/A/RES/73/289>

12. However, OIOS initiated in December 2019 the triennial reviews of: (i) the Evaluation of the United Nations Economic Commission for Europe⁹ conducted in 2016, and (ii) the Thematic Evaluation of the Regional Commissions¹⁰ conducted in 2017. The OIOS final report will be presented to the Committee of Programme and Coordination (CPC) of the General Assembly in 2020.

3.1.2 Internal evaluations

Programme-level evaluation of Gender mainstreaming in UNECE¹¹

13. A major evaluation of gender mainstreaming in UNECE was undertaken in 2019. The subject of the programme evaluation for the 2018-2019 biennium was approved by EXCOM during its 86th meeting in September 2016. The General Assembly further approved the evaluation theme via approval of the Programme Budget 2018-2019 in its resolution 72/261.

14. The evaluation came one year after the roll-out of UN System Wide Action Plan (UN-SWAP) 2.0 in November 2018, designed to focus on results for gender-related Sustainable Development Goals. The Terms of Reference were prepared using UNEG and UN-Women latest guidance on the subject. The evaluation assessed the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability of gender mainstreaming in UNECE, and the related results on gender equality and the empowerment of women.

15. The evaluation was undertaken during the first semester of 2019; it measured the progress, extent, and the influence of the UNECE Gender Equality Policy (2016), and the UNECE Gender Action Plans for 2016-2017 and 2018-2019, in all the areas of work of the eight subprogrammes. The evaluation found that UNECE's gender mainstreaming is relevant in term of its role and mandate, and that the strongest progress has been made in elaboration of gender equality policies and plans. The evaluation found that areas for improvement include: (i) mainstreaming gender in the nine UNECE focus SDGs; (ii) the extent to which detailed contextual analysis of gender equality inform policy and programme development; (iii) organizational culture; and (iv) capacity development for UNECE staff.

16. Thirty concrete and actionable recommendations have been formulated based upon the evaluation findings and conclusions, with reference to the 17 performance indicators of UN-SWAP 2.0. The management response¹² signed on 22 November, was submitted for information to the 108th meeting of EXCOM on 16 December. Progress on implementation will be reported in the 2020 Annual Report on Evaluation to EXCOM.

Subprogramme-level evaluation of the Environment Performance review (EPR) Process¹³

17. The objective of this evaluation was to conduct an external independent assessment of the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and impact of the EPR in supporting the

⁹ <https://undocs.org/E/AC.51/2017/5>

¹⁰ <https://undocs.org/E/AC.51/2017/8>

¹¹ http://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/OPEN_UNECE/03_Evaluation_and_Audit/Evaluation_Reports-with_SPs/Programme-wide_docs/FINAL_UNECE_GENDER_EVALUATION.pdf

¹² http://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/OPEN_UNECE/03_Evaluation_and_Audit/Evaluation_Reports-with_SPs/Programme-wide_docs/Management_Response_to_Gender_Evaluation_2019_-_Final_clean.pdf

¹³ http://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/OPEN_UNECE/03_Evaluation_and_Audit/Evaluation_Reports-with_SPs/01-Environment/Evaluation_of_EPR_2015-2019.pdf

UNECE member States to reconcile their environmental and economic targets with meeting the international environmental commitments. The evaluation assessed the entire EPR process and the reviews undertaken during 2015-2019.

18. The evaluation found that the EPRs' focus was highly relevant with to the specific needs and priorities of the beneficiary countries, and to the objectives and mandates of UNECE Subprogramme 1, Environment. The evaluation rating for effectiveness was high considering that the accomplishment rate of the planned activities was highly satisfactory. The evaluation also found that the sustainability of the EPRs and attention to impact related aspects varied from country to country. It noted that the relationship between human rights and environment was not addressed systematically, and that EPRs faced challenges in covering the green economy approach because of the lack of legal and policy framework for green economy and the shortage of specific green economy initiatives in almost all reviewed countries.

19. UNECE's management response for this evaluation was finalized in October 2019¹⁴. Progress will be reported in the 2020 Annual Report on Evaluation.

Subprogramme-level evaluation of UNECE's support to the advancement of Regulatory Cooperation and Standardization Policies in member States (Working Party 6)¹⁵

20. This evaluation assessed the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, sustainability and impact of Working Party 6 in supporting member States to reduce technical barriers to trade, and increase regulatory coherence in sectors that have a critical impact on sustainable development. The scope encompasses all activities undertaken under the auspices of Working Party 6 from January 2015 to December 2018.

21. The evaluation found that Working Party 6 has made a positive contribution within UNECE, particularly through the Gender Responsive Standards Initiative, and the Standards for the SDGs project, both of which illustrate for colleagues the wider relevance of standards for internationally agreed global goals for the 2030 Agenda and the UN Secretariat's policy of gender mainstreaming. The evaluation recommended, inter alia, to update and reflect the work of Working Party 6 in line with the 2030 Agenda, review and update the terms of reference of Working Party 6 in line with the Guidelines for the Establishment and Functioning of Working Parties within UNECE to assess and propose necessary adjustments to the mandate and status of Working Party 6, and submit to the Steering Committee on Trade Capacity and Standards for approval.

22. UNECE's management response for this evaluation will be finalized during the first quarter of 2020. Progress will be reported in the 2020 Annual Report on Evaluation.

3.2 Implementation of outstanding evaluation recommendations from internal evaluations

23. Since December 2018, progress reports from self-evaluations are prepared twice a year in June and December to inform on the actions taken to close the outstanding recommendations.

¹⁴ http://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/OPEN_UNECE/03_Evaluation_and_Audit/Evaluation_Reports-with_SPs/01-Environment/EPR_MR_signed_15.10.2019_.pdf

¹⁵ http://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/OPEN_UNECE/03_Evaluation_and_Audit/Evaluation_Reports-with_SPs/06-Trade/UNECE_WP6_Evaluation_-_final.pdf

Sixty-one recommendations (47%) were closed in 2019: 40 (31%) were implemented and 21 (16%) were closed without implementation. Sixty-nine recommendations (53%) were outstanding as of 31 December 2019. Summary tables as of 30 June and 31 December 2019 are presented in Annexes III and V and the details of the actions taken can be found in progress reports as of 31 December 2019, available on Open UNECE¹⁶ for each evaluation.

4. KEY CONCLUSIONS

24. On 12 March 2019, the Programme Management Unit organized an *Annual Exchange of Experience on Evaluations* with participation from 5 subprogrammes of UNECE who had conducted evaluations in 2018. In alignment with the UNECE Evaluation Policy, the purpose of this exercise was to: (i) to promote organizational learning, by identifying lessons learned and best practices; (ii) to contribute to improvement of programme performance; and (iii) to ensure the accountability of the Secretariat to evaluation results.
25. The discussion centered around the following topics: (i) project management costs; (ii) knowledge management; (iii) Impact of the projects; (iv) Gender; (v) Communicating results; and (vi) enhancing partnerships. The recommendations made in 2018 on these areas were discussed, with the aim to translate this knowledge into the development of new projects in 2019. The progress reports for each evaluation, available in Open UNECE, include meaningful examples of how the recommendations have been used to improve programme performance.
26. The Programme Management Unit will continue to organize an *Annual Exchange of Experience on Evaluations* in 2020, to discuss the recommendations formulated in the 13 end-of-projects evaluations done in 2019. The preliminary analysis of the 86 recommendations formulated reflects 6 key areas:
27. **Strengthening UNECE processes and design of interventions.** Twenty-two recommendations formulated in 2019 called for improved processes throughout the project cycle. One recommendation stressed the need to better estimate staff time and related costs at the time of planning to avoid delays. Another called for the inclusion of meaningful indicators of achievement in logical frameworks to better measure and report project progress.
28. **Continuation of UNECE activities/projects to obtain greater impact.** As noted in previous Annual Reports on Evaluation, evaluators have often recommended the extension of projects to continue or expand the impact of UNECE interventions. While 20 recommendations from 11 evaluations reports released in 2019 recommend such extensions, this is not always possible in the absence of funding for follow-up projects. This has been the main reason for the closure of 21 recommendations in 2019 without implementation, as reflected in para. 23.
29. **Strengthening the gender and human rights approaches.** As a result of an increased focus on gender in the 2019 evaluations as required by the UN-SWAP framework, as elaborated further in para. 52, 15 recommendations from 9 evaluation reports recommended actions to strengthen gender and human rights perspectives in UNECE projects: 12 recommendations were focused on gender, 3 on human rights, with 4 on both gender and human rights. Seven recommendations noted the importance of including gender-responsive indicators and targets in projects at the project planning stage.

¹⁶ <http://www.unece.org/info/open-unece/evaluation-and-audit.html>

30. **Better communication to promote the results of UNECE projects.** Fifteen recommendation in 8 evaluation reports advocated for additional efforts to communicate the results of the projects outside of UNECE. For example, the evaluation of the project *Strengthening national capacity for monitoring and assessing the progress in the implementation of MIPAA / RIS and 2012 Vienna Ministerial Declaration goals: Active Ageing Index* recommended to “document more examples of the application of the index in a way that is relevant for policy makers”.

31. **Increased collaboration with other institutions.** Ten recommendations from 9 evaluation reports noted existing collaborations and encouraged additional partnerships with relevant organizations to increase the impact of UNECE activities. While 6 recommendations were focused on UN entities, the other 4 proposed academia, additional donors, as well as national and regional institutions.

32. **Replication of successful UNECE projects to neighboring countries.** Four recommendations from 4 evaluation reports opined value in replicating successful UNECE projects and building on the lessons learnt in another region or country. For example, the Independent Review of the UNECE Project: *Removing Regulatory and Procedural Barriers to Trade in Belarus, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic* concluded that UNECE could consider this model as a pilot project that could be rolled out to other countries in future.

5. EVALUATIONS COMPLETED

33. The Biennial Evaluation Plan for 2018-2019 was approved by EXCOM in September 2016¹⁷. The Biennial Plans are developed based on an assessment of risk, as well as ensuring the widest possible coverage of the UNECE programme of work over successive biennia.

5.1 Internal evaluations

34. Thirteen evaluations planned for 2018-2019 were completed in 2019. In addition, a total of 3 end-of-project evaluations were conducted. The total value of the 13 projects evaluated amounted to USD \$6,360,000.

35. The evaluation of the project *Strengthening the capacity of SPECA countries for the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and the achievement of the SDGs*, scheduled for last quarter of 2019, will be completed by 30 March 2020.

The following 16 evaluations were completed in 2019:

	Category of Evaluation	Title of Evaluation	Sub-programme
1	Programme	Evaluation of Gender Mainstreaming in UNECE	All
2	Subprogramme	Evaluation of the Environment Performance Reviews (EPRs)	Environment

¹⁷ http://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/commission/EXCOM/Agenda/2016/87Excom-18Nov16/Item_2-Chair_conclusions_16.09.2016.pdf

3	Subprogramme	Evaluation of UNECE's support to the advancement of Regulatory Cooperation and Standardization Policies in Member States	Trade
4	UNDA Project	Strengthening the capacity in the most vulnerable countries in the UNECE region for the sustainable development of statistics	Statistics
5	UNDA Project	Sustainable Energy for All (SE4All) in Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia	Sustainable Energy
6	XB Project	Removing regulatory and procedural barriers to trade in Belarus, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan	Trade
7	XB Project	Strengthening the implementation of the UNECE Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution in Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia	Environment
8	XB Project	Strengthening the implementation of and accession to the UNECE Convention on the Transboundary effects of Industrial Accidents in Central Asia	Environment
9	XB Project	Implementation of the National Water and Health Targets in the Kyrgyz Republic and Tajikistan through National Policy Dialogues	Environment
10	XB Project	Transboundary Cooperation and Integrated Water Resources Management in the Chu and Talas River Basins	Environment
11	XB Project	Competitiveness, innovative policies and PPPs: capacity building for civil servants and business associations in CIS countries	Economic Cooperation & Integration
12	XB Project	Development and implementation of PPP international standards in support of SDGs	Economic Cooperation & Integration
13	XB Project	Enhancing national capacities for development and implementation of the energy efficiency standards in buildings in the UNECE region	Sustainable Energy
14	XB Project	Strengthening national capacity for monitoring and assessing the progress in the implementation of MIPAA / RIS and 2012 Vienna Ministerial Declaration goals: Active Ageing Index	Population
15	XB Project	Road Safety Phases I-IV	Transport
16	XB Project	Strengthening capacity of the ECE member States to achieve the energy-related Sustainable Development Goals ("Pathways to Sustainable Energy")	Sustainable Energy

Table 1: Evaluations Completed in 2019

5.2 External evaluation

36. During the year, UNECE participated in and/or supported 5 external evaluations of the UN Secretariat, or UN System-Wide as follows:

5.2.1 UN Office of Internal Oversight (OIOS)

Strengthening the role of evaluation and the application of evaluation findings on programme design, delivery and policy directives A/74/67¹⁸ and A/74/67/Corr.1¹⁹

37. The report provided an assessment of the state of evaluation across 31 United Nations entities during the biennium 2016–2017 in terms of evaluation functions, resources and practice. As compared with the previous period, entities made modest improvements to evaluation functions in terms of their organizational independence and outputs, including an increase in the overall number and quality of evaluation reports. However, shortfalls in evaluation capacity persisted: only six entities met the minimum organizational benchmark for evaluation expenditure, and estimated spending on evaluation was broadly below budgeted allocations. Evaluation reports continued to fall below system-wide standards regarding the integration of gender and human rights issues. At the entity level, there was an observable divergence between the entities that have further consolidated evaluation capacity and those that have not improved or that have fallen further behind.

38. The 2016-2017 Evaluation Dashboard²⁰ is a companion report of the OIOS Biennial Study, comprised of entity-level assessments. The Dashboard highlights three areas for strengthening evaluation in UNECE: (i) improvement in the framework to enhance the evaluation's function independence and to establish formal procedures for developing evaluation plans and to submit reports to the Executive Secretary; (ii) increased expenditures on evaluation reports to meet the benchmark of 5% of total programme budget; and (iii) increased quality of evaluation reports to fully meet UNEG standards.

Evaluation of United Nations entities' preparedness, policy coherence, and early results associated with their support to the Sustainable Development Goals²¹

39. This evaluation assessed the extent to which United Nations entities: (i) are prepared to maximize the relevance, efficiency and effectiveness of their individual and collective contributions to the Sustainable Development Goals; (ii) achieved policy coherence; and (iii) achieved early results through the provision of support to governments. Most UN entities have taken steps to align the relevance of their work with the 2030 Agenda but the extent of their preparedness to support Member States to achieve the SDGs has varied. While the Department of Economic and Social Affairs and the Regional Commissions have made changes to their work programmes; however, they still faced challenges in coordinating the work of UN entities around the 2030 Agenda. Furthermore, in the absence of an overarching system-wide plan, UN entities were still striving for coherence and efficiency, including around partnerships.

¹⁸ <https://undocs.org/en/A/74/67>

¹⁹ <https://undocs.org/en/A/74/67/corr.1>

²⁰ IED-19-002: <https://oios.un.org/file/7757/download?token=ZrGYQgvN>

²¹ IED-19-001: https://oios.un.org/file/7982/download?token=g8kBx_LU

40. UNECE noted with appreciation that OIOS found a high degree of change in UNECE in this report. To ensure effective support for member States in implementing the 2030 Agenda, UNECE must continue to embrace change. The global scale of the 2030 Agenda requires intensive international cooperation and partnership, prompting UN entities to rethink the focus of activities and working methods.

5.2.2 Joint Inspection Unit (JIU)

*Review of the United Nations System-wide Action Plan on Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women JIU/REP/2019/2*²²

41. This review offered a system-wide evaluation of the effectiveness, value added and impact of the System-wide Action Plan on Gender Equality and the Empowerment of Women as a tool for performance monitoring and accountability. In particular, the main objectives of the report were: (i) to provide the General Assembly with an assessment of the Action Plan as a system-wide performance monitoring and accountability framework; (ii) to review the processes and procedures for its implementation across the United Nations system; and (iii) to share good practices and lessons learned. The review covered the first phase of implementation of the System-Wide Action Plan, which began in 2012 and ended in December 2017.

42. UNECE found the analysis provided of great value as are the conclusions and recommendations suggested, given that they can contribute to increasing the quality of results, the engagement of the leadership and executive management in the UN-SWAP 2.0 process so that both the implementation and reporting is better anchored at the individual organization level and across the system. UNECE welcomed the recognition of the special needs and related capacities of smaller entities. This JIU review was valuable guidance for the Evaluation of Gender Mainstreaming in UNECE, referred to in section 3.1.2 of this report.

*Review of the integration of disaster risk reduction in the work of the United Nations system in the context of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development JIU/REP/2019/3*²³

43. In this report, the JIU analyzed the extent to which organizations have integrated the issue of disaster risk reduction in their corporate priorities, with regard to either normative or operational activities to implement their mandates. The report offers a comprehensive picture of the current status of disaster risk reduction mainstreaming in the work of the UN entities within the context of the Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction 2015-2030 and the UN Plan of Action on Disaster Risk Reduction for Resilience, Towards a Risk Informed and Integrated Approach to Sustainable Development, as endorsed by the United Nations Chiefs Executives Board (CEB) in 2016.

44. The review underscores that the integration of disaster risk reduction is intrinsic to the achievement of the 2030 Agenda. The recommendations aim to address gaps and reinforce collaboration among the system organizations to work as one, effectively and efficiently delivering on disaster risk reduction strategies in the context of the 2030 Agenda.

²² https://www.unjiu.org/sites/www.unjiu.org/files/jiu_rep_2019_2_english_0.pdf

²³ https://www.unjiu.org/sites/www.unjiu.org/files/jiu_rep_2019_3_en.pdf

Review of change management in United Nations system organizations JIU/REP/2019/4²⁴

45. The JIU reviewed the role and practice of change management in organizational reforms across the UN system over the past decade. The report examines what change management actually is, whether it is an important factor in achieving successful reform outcomes, and how it has been applied across United Nations system organizations.

46. UNECE welcomed the report and its findings and the opportunity it provides to review and learn from good practices in change management across the UN system.

6. EVALUATION PARTNERSHIPS

47. As a small Secretariat department, UNECE leverages partnerships with other relevant organizations to enhance its evaluative function and activities, and coordinates with the other Regional Commissions through the Chiefs of Programme Planning, and the Evaluation Focal Point Network. Moreover, UNECE collaborates with other UN entities on evaluation of joint activities. UNECE also engages with the JIU and OIOS on a regular basis.

6.1 UN Evaluation Group (UNEG)

48. UNECE has been an active member of UNEG since 2012. UNEG is an interagency professional network that brings together the evaluation units of the UN system, including UN departments, specialized agencies, funds and programmes, and affiliated organizations.

49. UNECE has actively contributed to discussions within UNEG for defining the future requirements for a centralized evaluation function in the UN Secretariat in HQ, in line with the negotiations regarding strengthening of the impact of the UN Development System.

7. UN-SWAP EVALUATION SCORECARD (GENDER) 2019

50. In 2018, UN-WOMEN rolled out the UN-SWAP 2.0, which represents an update of the previous framework, building into its lessons learnt from the first 5 years of implementation.

51. As part of the annual reporting requirements, each department conducts an annual meta-evaluation of all evaluations completed in the prior year. The UN-SWAP Evaluation Scorecard is a reporting tool organized around four criteria that capture the overall elements related to mainstreaming gender equality and the empowerment of women as reflected in the evaluation reports conducted by the entities in a given year.

52. UNECE achieved a rating of *Exceeds Requirements* for the inclusion of gender in evaluations in 2019 based on a review of 16 evaluation reports. This represents a significant improvement as compared with 2018, when UNECE was only *Approaching requirements*. The key drivers for this progression are (a) a systematic inclusion of the UNEG Guidance on Integrating Human Rights and Gender Equality in Evaluations during all phases of the evaluation in UNECE since the end of 2018; and (b) the release of the evaluation of Gender Mainstreaming in UNECE in June 2019, as referred to in Section 3.1.2 of this report.

²⁴ https://www.unjiu.org/sites/www.unjiu.org/files/jiu_rep_2019_4_english.pdf

8. FUTURE EVALUATIONS

53. The Biennial Evaluation Plan for 2020-21 as approved by EXCOM in its 95th meeting, is contained in Annex I. In addition, the projects scheduled to close in 2020 and which will undergo an evaluation are attached in Annex II.

54. In light of the 2019 evaluation of the project *Strengthening national capacity for monitoring and assessing the progress in the implementation of MIPAA / RIS and 2012 Vienna Ministerial Declaration goals: Active Ageing Index*²⁵, the topic of the 2020 Population subprogramme evaluation has been changed. Instead of looking again at the Active Ageing Index, the 2020 evaluation will focus on *Advancing intergovernmental work towards the implementation of the 2017 Lisbon Ministerial Declaration and MIPAA/RIS commitments*.

55. As the Programme Budget is now annual, the secretariat is not submitting a biennial plan for evaluation for 2022-2023. The 2022 Evaluation plan will be submitted in the context of the submission of the 2022 Proposed programme budget.

²⁵ http://www.unece.org/fileadmin/DAM/OPEN_UNECE/03_Evaluation_and_Audit/Evaluation_Reports-with_SPs/08-HLMP/AAI_Third_Phase_Evaluation_Report_FOR_WEB.pdf

Annex I: Approved Biennial Evaluation Plan 2020-2021

Evaluation Title		Purpose	By Whom	Resources (Financial & Human)	Schedule (Q/Y)	Type
No.	Internal Evaluations					
1	<i>Review of UNECE engagement with the private sector</i>	The Evaluation will consider the relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of UNECE engagement with the private sector from 2017-2021	Consultant (PMU)	\$18,000 (external consultant) P4 – 2 months G6 – 0.5 month	Q2 / 2021	Programme –level
2	<i>Review of UNECE collaboration with UN and other partners in delivering on energy for sustainable development</i>	The Evaluation will review the relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of UNECE collaboration with UN and external partners from 2016-2020	Consultant (Sustainable Energy Division)	\$10,000 (external consultant) P5 – 1.5 month G5 – 0.5 month	Q2 / 2020	Subprogramme – level
3	<i>Review of the Innovation Performance Reviews & Regional Index</i>	The Evaluation will review the relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of the methodology, selection process and follow up to the regional index from 2017-2020	Consultant (Economic Cooperation & Integration)	\$10,000 (external consultant) P5 – 1.5 months G5 – 0.5 month	Q4 / 2020	Subprogramme – level
4	<i>Review of the UNECE Active Ageing Index</i>	The evaluation will review the relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of UNECE policy and statistical aspects of the Active Ageing Index	Consultant (Population)	\$10,000 (external consultant) P5 – 1 month GS – 0.5 month	Q3 / 2020	Subprogramme – level
				Unit Monthly Cost²⁶	Total	
				Consultancy	\$48,000	
				P5 - 6 months	\$19,791	\$118,750
				P4 - 2 months	\$17,016	\$34,033
				G5/6 – 2 months	\$11,200	\$22,400
				Total:	\$ 223,183	

²⁶ Based on Standard Salary Costs Version 9 Year 2016

Annex II: Schedule of UNDA and XB Project Evaluations 2020

Evaluation Title		Funding Source/ Total Project Budget	By Whom	Estimated Resources (USD)	Responsible Staff / & SP Focal Point	Schedule (Q/Y)
1.	E262 Strengthening the capacity of SPECA countries for the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and the achievement of the SDGs (2016-2019)	XB \$547,000	Consultant	\$10,000	M. Apostolov, Trade	Q1/ 2020
2.	1617AN Strengthening national capacities of the UNECE countries for evidence-based regulatory and procedural trade policies to achieve the SDGs (2016- 2020)	UNDA \$620,000	Consultant	\$12,400	H. Daoudi, Trade	Q3/ 2020
3.	1617V Accountability systems for sustainable forest management in Caucasus and Central Asian countries (2016- 2020)	UNDA \$591,000	Consultant	\$11,800	R. Michalak, Forestry and Timber	Q3/ 2020
4.	1617W Evidence-based policies for sustainable housing and urban development in the UNECE region (2016- 2020)	UNDA \$589,000	Consultant	\$11,800	G. Roll, Housing, land management and population	Q3/ 2020
5.	E271 EU Water Initiative Plus for Eastern Partnership countries (EUWI+ 4 EaP) (2016-2020)	XB \$3,780,000	Consultant	\$44,000	F. Bernardini, Environment	Q3/ 2020
6.	E287 Capacity-building for cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia (Phase 3) (2017-2020)	XB \$302,400	Consultant	\$6,000	S. Radnaaragchaa, Environment	Q3/ 2020
7.	E264 Enhancing coherence and integration of economic and social statistics in support of the implementation of 2008 System of National Accounts (SNA) (2017-2020)	XB \$912,000	Consultant	\$18,000	C. Boldsen, Statistics	Q4/ 2020
8.	E293 Strengthening the capacity of Central Asian countries to implement trade facilitation measures and better integrate into the international rules-based trading system (2018-2019)	XB \$350,000	Consultant	\$6,000	M. Ceccarelli, Trade	Q4/ 2020
Total				\$120,000		

Annex III: Summary of Evaluation Recommendations as at 30 June 2019

Division	Project	Recs outstanding as at 31.12.2018	New recs since 01.01.2019	Recs closed as at 30.06.2019	Recs closed but not implemented as at 30.06.2019	Outstanding recs as at 30.06.2019
ED	Capacity-building for cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia Phase 2	3	-	2	-	1
<i>ED</i>	<i>Strengthening cooperation on hydrology and environment between Tajikistan and Afghanistan in the upper Amu Darya River basin (Pyanj River)</i>	-	7	-	-	7
<i>ED</i>	<i>Strengthening Cooperation on Water Quality Management in Central Asia</i>	-	7	1	-	6
ED	Strengthening Governments' and Water Operators' Capacity to Ensure Equity of Access to Water and Sanitation in Countries with Economies in Transition in the UNECE Region, with a Particular Focus on Small-Scale Water Supplies and Sanitation in Rural Areas	4	-	1	-	3
STD	Strengthening the national road safety management capacities of selected developing countries and countries with economies in transition	4	-	-	-	4
STD	Strengthening the Capacities of Developing Countries and Countries with Economies in Transition to Facilitate Legitimate Border Crossing, Regional Cooperation and Integration	4	-	4	-	-
<i>STD</i>	<i>ITC support to governments in climate change mitigation: lessons from the use of ForFITS tool that links policy choices and CO2 emission scenarios for inland transport</i>	-	11	1	-	10
SED	Review of the case studies of the application of best practices guidance for coal mine methane management	2	-	-	-	2
<i>ECTD</i>	<i>Development and implementation of PPP international standards in support of the SDGs</i>	-	6	1	-	5
ECTD	PPP Initiative: PPP Toolkit and International PPP Centre of Excellence	-	6	4	-	2
ECTD	Strengthening the capacity of transition and developing economies to participate in cross-border agricultural food supply chains	2	-	1	1	-
<i>ECTD</i>	<i>Strengthening national capacities of the CIS countries to implement ECE agricultural quality standards”</i>	-	6	2	-	4
<i>ECTD</i>	<i>Removing Regulatory and Procedural Barriers to Trade in Belarus, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic</i>	-	9	5	-	4
FLHD	Strengthening national capacities for sustainable housing and urban development in countries with economies in transition	2	-	2	-	-
		21	52	24	1	48
<i>Lines in italic indicate a Management Response released after 1 January 2019.</i>		29%	71%	33%	1%	66%

Annex IV: List of recommendations from internal evaluations closed as of 30 June 2019

Sub Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 30 June 2019
Environment	Capacity-building for cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia Phase 3	May-17	1	The upcoming projects related to dam safety in Central Asia, if any, should address cooperation and capacity-building in dam safety in Central Asia, especially the focus on transboundary rivers.	In the new project, “Capacity-building for cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia (phase 3)” to be implemented September 2017 to June 2020, the further support to cooperation and capacity-building in dam safety in Central Asia including a focus on transboundary issues is fully addressed. The expected accomplishments of the new project are: EA1. Improved inter-state cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia EA2. Improved national capacities in development and implementation of legal, regulatory and technical frameworks on dam safety in Central Asia EA3. Improved safety and transboundary cooperation on individual dams The activities of the new project are: A1.1. Organisation of 3 annual regional meeting for exchange of information and development of interstate cooperation; A2.1. Support to drafting by consultants of national legislation and organization of two roundtables/seminars to discuss draft legislation; A2.2. Organisation of two regional capacity building events to “train the trainers” on dam safety; A3.1. Development and showcasing of the dam technical solutions for transboundary safety monitoring.	Implemented in May 2019. The project, “Capacity-building for cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia (phase 3)” is aimed at improving cooperation, building capacity and improving the management of dams on transboundary rivers. The regional meeting on Cooperation on Dams Safety in Central Asia, May 2019, supported a bilateral meeting to discuss cooperation between the countries on dams safety issues, capacity building and management of dams located on transboundary rivers between Tajikistan and Uzbekistan (https://www.unece.org/env/water/damsafety_third_phase.html).
Environment	Capacity-building for cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia Phase 3	May-17	4	The UNECE should continue its efforts and enhance cooperation with the donors/international development organizations. The governments of Central Asia countries should consider increasing funding for dam safety issues. The Central Asia countries may wish to set up a permanent Dam Safety Working Group to operate at the regular forum that the EC IFAS in Kazakhstan has suggested should be establish. The officially nominated Project focal points could serve as a core of such a Group. This will steer the future sustainability of work.	The new project “Capacity-building for cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia (phase 3)” funded by the Russian Federation 2017-2020 is set up with these intentions. As before, donors and international donor organizations will be invited to the regional meetings for discussions on cooperation and co-funding. Presently discussions on cooperation and co-funding from a Slovak initiative is underway. During the regional meetings regular discussions will be organised to discuss increased funding from the Central Asian countries. The first regional meeting will be organised by EB IFAS in Kazakhstan in March 2018 to demonstrate the establishment of the regular forum. During the first meeting, a separate discussion will be organised with Project focal points on the possibility that these may form a permanent Dam Safety Working Group.	Implemented in May 2019. The regional meeting conducted in May 2019 in Tashkent involved several donor and development organizations such as, GIZ, OSCE, EBRD, CAREC, French Development Agency. The event aimed to raise awareness on the problems of safe management of dams among donor and development organizations, deepen and expand cooperation in the area and mobilize additional support. This resulted in an agreement with the Slovak Agency on Dams Management to host a training workshop for CA experts in October 2019 with travel support by GIZ and OSCE. In addition, the OSCE Center in Dushanbe agreed to support bilateral cooperation on dam safety between Tajikistan and Uzbekistan. Informal discussion to include the dam safety as a component of the SPECA Working Group on Water, Energy and Environment was initiated at the regional meeting in May 2019. The issue will be discussed during the regional meeting on dam safety in 2020. The Project focal points are nominated

Sub Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 30 June 2019
Environment	Strengthening Governments' and water operators' capacity ensure equity of access to water and sanitation in countries with economies in transition in the Economic Commission for Europe region, with a particular focus on small-scale water supplies and sanitation in rural areas	Mar-18	3	Continuation with similar Project implementation arrangements and the personnel who managed and executed the Project at the UNECE and WHO/Europe (and other Implementing Organizations).	<p>The recommendation is fully accepted.</p> <p>(a) Coordination of activities implemented by UNECE and WHO/Europe: on-going process of coordination between UNECE and WHO /Europe for the implementation of all activities under the joint secretariat of the Protocol on Water and Health.</p> <p>(b) Fundraising efforts to be carried out in 2018 (cf. recommendation 1)</p>	<p>Implemented in June 2019.</p> <p>(a) UNECE and WHO/Europe provide joint secretariat for the Protocol. No new UNDA project or other project was granted to allow such joint project, despite joint fund-raising.</p> <p>(b) Implemented between April 2018 and November 2019. For further details see Progress report under Recommendation 1 (a)</p>
Environment	Strengthening cooperation on water quality management in central Asia	Dec-18	3	For similar projects of the UNECE, the furniture and equipment class of expenditure ("Investments" budget component) can be regarded as not appropriate. It is recommended to the UNECE to ensure that the project starts without delay or, should it be impossible, that the Project term is extended proportionally.	<p>UNECE accepts this recommendation. Better situation analysis will be conducted at the project design stage to ensure the project starts without delay. The recommendation on furniture and equipment is also accepted</p>	<p>Implemented in June 2019.</p> <p>These recommendations were considered and included in the project proposal. The situation analysis was conducted in close cooperation with agencies concerned and furniture/investment component is excluded from the project proposal.</p>
Transport	Strengthening the capacities of developing countries and countries with economies in transition to facilitate legitimate border crossing, regional cooperation and integration	Nov-16	1	The project team should consider developing a strategic/sustainability business plan that will focus on turning the pilot C2C data exchange platform into a full-scale functioning system.	<p>A strategic business plan, including the financing of the hosting and maintenance of a large scale and resilient version of the exchange platform developed and deployed in the course of this project, will be considered as the starting point of any follow up global project but will also be presented to the international bodies dealing with the TIR Convention for their consideration</p>	<p>Implemented as of June 2019</p> <p>The platform is functioning in production mode and is used by the governments of Georgia and Turkey. It is maintained by the TIR secretariat. No further requests for its use have been received as of June 2019. Consequently, there has been no need to scale it up.</p>
Transport	Strengthening the capacities of developing countries and countries with economies in transition to facilitate legitimate border crossing, regional cooperation and integration	Nov-16	2	Conduct a risk assessment and propose risk mitigation measures at the early stage (design) of the project.	<p>Project managers, at the project inception, will be recommended to include in the project document a detailed risk assessment matrix, a description of monitoring methods and tools as well as lists of risk mitigation measures.</p>	<p>Implemented as of June 2019</p> <p>A Risks and mitigation actions section was added in the following documents in December 2017:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Project concept note template - Project Document for XB projects
Transport	Strengthening the capacities of developing countries and countries with economies in transition to facilitate legitimate border crossing, regional cooperation and integration	Nov-16	4	Utilize a coherent and cost saving approach through strengthened collaboration with the specialized agencies.	<p>UNECE is already collaborating with the International Road Transport Union (IRU) on similar projects (see ongoing UNECE-IRU MoU of 24 March 2015). UNECE is already in discussion with IRU to continue such collaborations in the future and, possibly, leverage synergies between similar projects. Furthermore, a donor mapping exercise could also be included in the strategic business plan (see follow up action of Rec.1).</p>	<p>Implemented as of June 2019</p> <p>UNECE signed a five-years MoU and Contribution Agreement (CA) with the International Road Transport Union (IRU) on 6 October 2017. The purpose of the MoU and CA is to further strengthen cooperation between UNECE and IRU towards the full computerization of the TIR procedure. The use of the platform as a tool to further facilitate the exchange of TIR data among Contracting parties has been integrated in the workplans agreed by both parties, in line with the provisions of the CA.</p>

Sub Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 30 June 2019
Transport	Strengthening the capacities of developing countries and countries with economies in transition to facilitate legitimate border crossing, regional cooperation and integration	Nov-17	5	Continue engagement with national stakeholders and potential users of the platform to identify their needs and provide technical support (legal, advisory, etc.) to streamline processes and precondition required to access the platform.	The exchange platform, by design, allow the secure exchange of a wide range of information. Through easy configuration, new agents and new messages can be added. The information relative to the functioning of the platform has been published on the project website. All Regional Commission have agreed that they will continue promoting the use of the platform at any available opportunity.	Implemented as of June 2019 ECE ensured that the platform has been integrated in the development relative to eTIR (see Rec. 4). Other RC did not receive requests regarding the use of the platform.
Transport	ITC support to governments in climate change mitigation: lessons from the use of ForFITS tool that links policy choices and CO2 emission scenarios for inland transport	Jul-18	11	Ensure that gender balance is considered in the planning, implementation, and monitoring of activities relating to ForFITS.	UNECE fully accepts the recommendation. To download the publicly-available version of ForFITS, a form will be developed to voluntary collect information about the user of ForFITS. Gender will be required on a voluntary basis and tracked to assess the parity in ForFITS users, which is unknown until now.	Implemented in June 2019 On-line questionnaire requiring optional information about the entity/person downloading ForFITS, including gender has been deployed since May 2019. The survey has shown that 40 % of ForFITS user that downloaded the tool from May 2019 are female, based on the declaration of user who filled the questionnaire. Further tracking of gender parity will be carried on to see how this parameter evolves over time.
Economic Cooperation & Integration	Development and implementation of PPP international standards in support of the Sustainable Development Goals	Oct-17	3	UNECE should perform an internal assessment of the projects implemented within the Economic Cooperation and Trade Division, in order to establish the suitable number and size of projects managed in parallel by the staff.	UNECE partially agrees with this recommendation. The number and size of projects depend on extra budgetary resources raised by the secretariat and approved by the member States. On his part, the Chief of the Cooperation and Partnerships Section will ensure that the work load pertaining to the implementation of projects within the Section is adequately distributed among staff on the basis of seniority and experience.	Implemented in June 2019 The work load pertaining to the implementation of projects within the Cooperation & Partnerships Section is adequately distributed among staff on the basis of seniority and experience. This is reflected in staff performance work plans for 2019-2020.
Economic Cooperation & Integration	Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) Initiative: PPP Toolkit and International PPP Centre of Excellence	Oct-18	1	In order to establish the People-First (PF)-PPPs as a main financing modality for sustainable development, UNECE should advocate the adoption of people-first principles at least across the UN System (in the first stage) through a “One-UN” approach. This might be achieved gradually either through a bottom-up approach (having the national governments requesting this in a formalized manner) or by proposing UN a general adoption of PF-PPP standards through internal (political or technical) mechanisms. As an organization with a high degree of credibility, the United Nations took take the lead role in regulating and creating standards for PPPs that would enable a wider acceptance and a more robust involvement of the private capital in financing sustainable	UNECE partially accepts this recommendation. UNECE member States strongly believe that the traditional PPP model needs to transition to people-first in order to have any impact vis-à-vis the SDGs and have asked us to promote this across the UN system. The Guiding Principles on people-first PPPs for the SDGs have been published as a UNECE contribution to paragraph 48 of the Addis Ababa Action Agenda on Financing for Development. The UNECE works closely with other UN bodies within the interagency task force on Financing for Development and continues to explore options to promote this work collaboratives. However, it cannot assume a leadership role on this unless this role is recognized by other UN bodies. At its session in March 2018, the Committee on Innovation, Competitiveness and Public-Private Partnerships (Decision 2018 – 4b.6) : “Encouraged the secretariat to continue working closely with the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, the other Regional Commissions, UNCTAD, other United Nations agencies and the World Bank to make the guiding principles on people-first PPPs for the SDGs a joint contribution to the Inter-agency Task Force on Financing for Development in response to paragraph 48 of the Addis Ababa Action Agenda for adoption in the spirit of “Delivering as One”.	Implemented in May 2019 The recommendation was implemented in May 2019 when at the fourth International PPP Forum in Geneva on 7-9 May 2019, the five UN Regional Commissions agreed to work together to make PPP ‘fit for purpose’ for the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (see UNECE press release at: https://www.unece.org/?id=51760)

Sub Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 30 June 2019
				development. An additional advantage of UNECE is the unique intergovernmental body – the Team of Specialists (later upgraded to the Working Party on PPPs). This comparative advantage should be further capitalized by UNECE in being the leading entity on PF-PPP matter.	UNECE will continue to promote its PPP work within the UN system, and in the context of the interagency task force.	
Economic Cooperation & Integration	Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) Initiative: PPP Toolkit and International PPP Centre of Excellence	Oct-18	2	The private sector has a distinct performance advantage through its efficient and streamlined processes, maximizing the efficiency and thus bringing more ‘value for money’. The private sector is knowledgeable about PPPs, but less so about sustainable development and the SDGs. Especially the top management within the private companies started to become more aware of SDGs, not so the middle management. This niche can be considered by UNECE to become a broker between the public and the private sector.	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation. UNECE works with the private sector (construction companies, consultants, lenders), especially through the PPP Business Advisory Board, which set up a special SDG task force with the aim of promoting the SDGs among the private sector. The PPP Business Advisory Board is a formal UNECE body set up by the Executive Committee (ECE/EX/2014/L.16) and is made up of 30 leading private sector PPP experts.</p> <p>This is an ongoing process, and UNECE will continue advocating with the private sector during its intergovernmental meetings and the PPP Forums to ensure that they are fully aware of the SDGs.</p>	<p>Implemented in May 2019</p> <p>This recommendation was implemented in May 2019 at the fourth International PPP Forum with awareness raising briefings for the private sector participants on the SDGs and how PPPs can contribute to their achievement.</p>
Economic Cooperation & Integration	Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) Initiative: PPP Toolkit and International PPP Centre of Excellence	Oct-18	3	A central focus for ICoE should be on creating universal standards in PF-PPPs. Drafting guidelines and standards for PF-PPP should be done by the UN, not by the member States’ governments nor by the private sector. For this, a mechanism of public consultations similar to public consultations for SDGs could be envisaged and should specifically involve non-state actors. After defining the guidelines and standards, a mechanism for legal adoption by member States’ Parliaments should be created.	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation. The PPP standards, guiding principles, declarations, best practices and recommendations developed by UNECE through its intergovernmental process have a very broad appeal beyond the UNECE region. One of the stages of the development of the standards is a very broad public consultation period of at least two months, where the secretariat proactively solicits comments and feedback from a variety of stakeholders – governments, private sector, NGOs, academia, IGOs. As per the mandate by the Commission, all these outputs are voluntary in nature and do not pose any obligations on the member States unless they decide to implement them in a variety of ways (e.g. through legislation, administrative instructions etc). A mechanism for legal adoption is presently outside the UNECE PPP mandate.</p>	<p>Implemented in March 2019</p> <p>This recommendation was implemented in March 2019, with the adoption by the member States of three international PPP standards (roads, railway and renewable energy), the five People-first PPP outcomes and 10 guiding principles on People-first PPPs for the SDGs. These policy documents were the result of a collective effort by a variety of stakeholders (member States, private sector, NGOs, academia), and involved a robust public consultation process. As a result, the policy documents were endorsed by all stakeholders.</p>

Sub Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 30 June 2019
Economic Cooperation & Integration	Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) Initiative: PPP Toolkit and International PPP Centre of Excellence	Oct-18	7	The project created and maintains a very well-designed web-site populated with reach content. A similar future project should consider hosting a more interactive information and knowledge exchange between the SCoEs (video conferences or scheduled meetings, either among the Centres or coordinated by the Secretariat through the WebEx platform). This interactive tool could also be used in public consultation stages. An Annual Report on PPPs (similar to Human Development Report) could be another effective tool to make PPPs better accepted and raise the visibility of UNECE.	The first report to the Bureau of the Working Party on PPPs covering the period December 2017 to November 2018 will be published by March 2019. The first meeting of the Specialist Centres of Excellence will take place in Beijing on 3-4 December 2018.	Implemented in March 2019 The recommendation was implemented in March 2019 with the publication of the report of the meeting of the UNECE-affiliated International PPP Specialist Centres of Excellence (ECE/CECI/2019/INF.9)
Trade	Strengthening the capacity of transition and developing economies to participate in cross-border agricultural food supply chains	Feb-18	2	As a result of activities in Central Asia, an informal standing working group ("Central Asia Working Group") was established, having an advisory function for UNECE. In order to capitalize on the initiative, a degree of formalization should be envisaged and UNNExT could serve as a model. Similar approaches within UNECE (e.g. International Centres of Excellence on Public Private Partnerships or the Group of Experts on Coal Mine Methane) also prove to be effective models. When establishing such working groups, the approach should also contain retaining mechanisms for good qualified specialists, in order to minimize their fluctuation.	UNECE has already approached the already existing informal standing working group Central Asia ("Central Asia Working Group") and first discussions on closer and permanent collaboration will take place in June 2018. In the immediate future, the informal working group has provided input to UNECE's regular work - i.e. submitted proposals for new work; commented on on-going work on standards and implementation to of the two Specialized Sections on Fresh Fruit and Vegetables; as well as Dry and Dried Produce. In addition, at the invitation of the UNECE secretariat, members of the working group will attend the regular meetings of the Specialized Sections on Fresh fruit and Vegetables; Dry and Dried Produce in May and June 2018. Mechanism on how to formally integrate the working group will be discussed at the November 2018 session of the Working Party on Agricultural Quality Standards. This integration could be finalized at the earliest by Spring 2019.	Implemented in May 2019 UNECE has held preliminary discussions with the Central Asia Working Group and the Chairs of the UNECE Specialized Section on Fresh Fruit and Vegetables as well as Dry and Dried Produce. Given the complexity of establishing and integrating a new structure&/group, it was decided to leave the Central Asia working Group as a separate entity outside and formal UN structure. UNECE and its Specialized Sections will continue to advise the group and closely collaborate with the group. In addition, an e-coaching mechanism has been set up to provide continuous coaching on a monthly basis.
Trade	Strengthening national capacities of the CIS countries to implement ECE agricultural quality standards (E236)	Sep-18	3	The UNECE secretariat is encouraged to consider supporting strengthening and facilitating formalized links between Lorkh Institute, Shushary Lab and Laboratory in North Ossetia to co-develop action planning or facilitate implementation of strategies for self-sustaining operations, to further effect and potential impact of UNECE contributions on Russian market.	The secretariat accepts the recommendations within the limits of its mandate of providing a platform for member States' cooperation. UNECE will contact the three laboratories and invite them to participate in the work of the Specialized Section on Seed Potatoes (GE6) in order to link the laboratories up with each other and with other member States.	Implemented in April 2019. The secretariat invited the three laboratories to all meetings of the Specialized Section on Seed Potatoes (GE.6) taking place in 2019, including the forty-sixth session of the Specialized Section (18 - 19 March 2019) and a Rapporteurs' Meeting in Montana, US (September 2019). Members from the Shushary Lab and the adviser from the Lorkh Laboratory participated in the Geneva meeting and have indicated their intention to attend the Meeting in the USA. Both laboratories reported on their cooperation and joint activities. The laboratories have been invited to develop exchange of experience and ideas among themselves, including based on materials developed by GE.6 in Russian.

Sub Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 30 June 2019
Trade	Strengthening national capacities of the CIS countries to implement ECE agricultural quality standards (E236)	Sep-18	6	It is recommended that UNECE Secretariat involves all relevant staff members while developing and implementing the project interventions to ensure knowledge and expertise transfer. The mechanism should be in particular in place in case of soon to retire staff.	The secretariat accepts the recommendation.	Implemented in May 2019 Handover notes were prepared by the staff member who was the initial project manager for this activity. In addition, the Chief of Section made sure that all experts as well as the management of GE.6 were fully informed of the work undertaken and opportunities of further work.
Trade	Removing Regulatory and Procedural Barriers to Trade in Belarus, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic	Feb-19	1	The project will remain relevant as the three beneficiary countries continue their process of regulatory harmonisation and expanding their network of global partners. UNECE could consider this model to be a pilot project that could be rolled out to other countries in future	UNECE accepts the recommendation. It will share the experience gained with member States and use this project as a reference model when designing similar projects. - Hana Daoudi, Market Access Section is sharing the results of this project with member States, as part of the annual session of the UNECE Steering Committee on Trade Capacity and Standards (http://www.unece.org/trade/meetings.html#0/0/0/39818). Representatives from the three countries were invited to share their experience during the 2018 session and will be updating member States on follow-up activities and emerging needs during the 2019 session, scheduled to be held on 28-29 May in Geneva, Switzerland. - Mika Vepsäläinen, Market Access Section will reiterate UNECE's readiness to roll out the project in other countries during the 2019 annual session of the Steering Committee on Trade Capacity and Standards. A similar statement will also be made by UNCTAD.	Implemented in May 2019 The results of the project were shared with the member States during the SCTCS 2019 annual session: (i) representatives of the three beneficiary countries reported on project achievements and follow-up activities to sustain achievements beyond the international funding cycle under agenda item 8b presentations are available at: http://www.unece.org/index.php?id=50609 (ii) Project evaluation report were shared with member States under agenda item 8 (b). • The secretariat reported, under agenda item 8b, that discussions were underway with UNCTAD to ensure Kazakhstan's and Kyrgyzstan's access and use of the software that was being developed by UNCTAD to enable countries to update the NTM legislation published on UNCTAD TRAINS (see report of the meeting, paragraph 57). • UNCTAD expressed readiness to roll out the project in other ECE countries under agenda item 6 (see report of the meeting, paragraph 46)
Trade	Removing Regulatory and Procedural Barriers to Trade in Belarus, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic	Feb-19	2	Upon request from member states, UNECE should stand ready to review the content produced by the project and ensure it is both up to date and compliant with MTS requirements on a regular basis.	UNECE accepts this recommendation. Ensuring the sustainability of the project results beyond the international funding cycle. Hana Daoudi, UNECE Market Access Section is in discussion with UNCTAD to ensure that the three countries will have access to UNCTAD's new software for enabling communication between government agencies. The software will be launched during the second half of 2019.	Implemented in June 2019 Actions have been taken to ensure implementation in a follow up project. UNECE has handed over the information to UNCTAD at the end of the project and stand ready to further participate in another project, should the request be made by member States. UNCTAD will work closely with Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan to ensure access and use of the software that was being developed by UNCTAD to enable countries to update the NTM legislation published on UNCTAD TRAINS. Ensuring such access will involve a follow up project, which will be implemented by UNCTAD (lead) in cooperation with UNECE (support) upon receipt of explicit requests from the Governments
Trade	Removing Regulatory and Procedural Barriers to Trade in Belarus, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic	Feb-19	4	UNECE could assist trainees to set up a self-managed and closed social media group in 2019 and nominate a group administrator. This initiative requires no further financial input.	Hana Daoudi, Market Access Section stands ready to advise on the thematic issues that the group needs to take into account during the first few months to ensure information sharing and continuity of group discussions. This recommendation will be shared with the group for their consideration and decision on action.	Implemented in May 2019 Representatives of the three countries did not raised this need during their interventions at the 2019 annual session of the Steering Committee or during their discussions with the secretariat.

Sub Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 30 June 2019
Trade	Removing Regulatory and Procedural Barriers to Trade in Belarus, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic	Feb-19	6	The inclusion of business and the media before, during and after the policy reform process can lead to increased ownership of new policy regulations. More communications by the media in cooperation with market support institutions in future UNECE projects about its tools and output would increase use by Micro, Small & Medium Enterprises (MSMEs), women traders, for example.	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation. Governments tend to prefer publicizing reform results, including projects, upon successful completion. This was the case of the three beneficiary countries.</p> <p>Hana Daoudi, UNECE Market Access Section will encourage Governments to publicize project activities during the implementation phase.</p>	<p>Implemented during 1st semester 2019</p> <p>The decision to publicise the results of the project is up to the Governments. Both Kazakhstan and Belarus decided to publicize the results of the project in May 2019 to mark their reporting on project achievements to the annual session of the Steering Committee:</p> <p>-The press release by Belarus is available at: http://www.ecopress.by/ru/news/8/detail/237472/back.html</p> <p>-The press release by Kazakhstan is available at: http://mfa.gov.kz/en/geneva/contentview/kazakhstan-stal-predsdatelem-rukovodasegokomiteta-cek-oon-po-potencialu-i-standartamtorgovli</p>
Trade	Removing Regulatory and Procedural Barriers to Trade in Belarus, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic	Feb-19	7	UNECE can continue to support governments by using annual progress reports, the Steering Committee or roundtables to document progress.	Hana Daoudi, Market Access Section has organized the participation of representatives from the three beneficiary countries at the upcoming Steering Committee session (28-29 May 2019) to brief member States on follow up activities and emerging needs.	<p>Implemented in May 2019</p> <p>Representatives of the three beneficiary countries participated at the 2019 annual session of the Steering Committee (see comments under recommendation no.1)</p>
Housing, Land Management & Population	Strengthening national capacities for sustainable housing in selected countries with economies in transition	Jan-18	3	The HLMU should when resources are available strategize shifting the emphasis in its capacity development activities towards e-learning and taking advantage of best practices in online training.	<p>The recommendation is fully accepted.</p> <p>The HLMU has mapped available resources and tools to offer e-learning. This includes online thematic lectures in English and Russian languages on relevant topics saved on YouTube and available through web.</p> <p>HLMU has discussed establishment of regional portal using innovative e-learning approaches with the SDGU which is currently considering establishment of such a portal for the UNECE region. This initiative would require additional funds, which. The viability of this option will be determined by 31 December 2018.</p> <p>Task of strategizing completed in March-April 2018. The work on setting up e-learning materials on SDG Help desk will be conducted in August-December 2018 by Gulnara Roll.</p>	<p>Implemented in June 2019</p> <p>The concept of the regional observatory on urban related SDGs was developed and reflected in the Committee on Housing and Land Management official documentation (ECE/HBP/2018/1 para 7 and 59) and information document (ECE/HBP/2018/Inf.1). Responsible staff is Gulnara Roll, Head of Housing and Land Management Unit.</p> <p>The online training materials were made available at http://www.unece.org/housing-and-land-management/trainingmaterials.html</p>
Housing, Land Management & Population	Strengthening national capacities for sustainable housing in selected countries with economies in transition	Jan-18	4	The HLMU webpage with online information on best practices should be created and desirably complemented with an online forum facility for experts. This is subject to availability of resources. It should be linked to the UN-Habitat Best Practices Database, Best Practices Unit and Global Urban Lectures webpages.	<p>The recommendation is fully accepted</p> <p>The UNECE webpage, http://www.unece.org/housing-and-land-management/training-materials.html, has been created. The UN-Habitat materials are available through this webpage. As explained above, further SDG helpdesk portal will be used as the platform.</p>	<p>Closed as implemented in June 2019</p> <p>The webpage is being regularly updated.</p>

Annex V: Summary of Evaluation Recommendations as at 31 December 2019

Division	Project	Recs outstanding as at 30.06.2019	New recs since 01.07.2019	Recs closed as at 31.12.2019	Recs closed but not implemented as at 31.12.2019	Outstanding recs as at 31.12.2019
ED	Capacity-building for cooperation on dam safety in Central Asia Phase 2	1	-	-	-	1
ED	Strengthening cooperation on hydrology and environment between Tajikistan and Afghanistan in the upper Amu Darya River basin (Pyanj River)	7	-	-	5	2
ED	Strengthening Cooperation on Water Quality Management in Central Asia	6	-	1	5	-
ED	Strengthening Governments' and Water Operators' Capacity to Ensure Equity of Access to Water and Sanitation in Countries with Economies in Transition in the UNECE Region, with a Particular Focus on Small-Scale Water Supplies and Sanitation in Rural Areas	3	-	3	-	-
ED	<i>Strengthening Industrial Safety in Central Asia through the Implementation of and Accession to the UNECE Convention on the Transboundary Effects of Industrial Accidents</i>	-	6	-	-	6
ED	<i>Strengthening the implementation of the UNECE Convention on long-range transboundary air pollution in Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia</i>	-	8	-	-	8
ED	<i>Transboundary Cooperation and Integrated Water Resources Management in the Chu and Talas River Basins</i>	-	8	-	-	8
ED	<i>Implementation of the National Water and Health Targets in the Kyrgyz Republic and Tajikistan through National Policy Dialogues</i>	-	8	2	-	6
ED	<i>Environment Performance Review process in the period 2015–2019</i>	-	6	-	-	6
STD	Strengthening the national road safety management capacities of selected developing countries and countries with economies in transition	4	-	-	-	4
STD	ITC support to governments in climate change mitigation: lessons from the use of ForFITS tool that links policy choices and CO2 emission scenarios for inland transport	10	-	1	-	9
SD	<i>Strengthening national capacity in the most vulnerable UNECE countries for the sustainable development of statistics</i>	-	8	-	-	8
SED	Review of the case studies of the application of best practices guidance for coal mine methane management	2	-	-	-	2
SED	<i>Enhancing National Capacities for Development and Implementation of the Energy Efficiency Standards in Buildings in the UNECE Region</i>	-	7	-	-	7
ECTD	Development and implementation of PPP international standards in support of the SDGs	5	-	1	4	-
ECTD	PPP Initiative: PPP Toolkit and International PPP Centre of Excellence	2	-	1	-	1

Division	Project	Recs outstanding as at 30.06.2019	New recs since 01.07.2019	Recs closed as at 31.12.2019	Recs closed but not implemented as at 31.12.2019	Outstanding recs as at 31.12.2019
ECTD	<i>Competitiveness, innovative policies and public-private partnerships: capacity building for civil servants and business associations</i>	-	6	5	-	1
ECTD	Strengthening national capacities of the CIS countries to implement ECE agricultural quality standards”	4	-	2	2	-
ECTD	Removing Regulatory and Procedural Barriers to Trade in Belarus, Kazakhstan and Kyrgyz Republic	4	-	-	4	-
		48	57	16	20	69
		46%	54%	15%	19%	66%

Annex VI: List of recommendations from internal evaluations closed as of 31 December 2019

Sub-Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 31 December 2019
Environment	Strengthening Governments' and water operators' capacity ensure equity of access to water and sanitation in countries with economies in transition in the Economic Commission for Europe region, with a particular focus on small-scale water supplies and sanitation in rural areas	Mar-18	1	As part of the Protocol on Water and Health work programme 2017-2019, UNECE should consider to extending the Project (similar scope, activities, outcomes, etc.) to other countries that are either signatories, Parties and are considering ratifying the Protocol. More emphasis should be directed towards addressing issues and inequities and challenges of small-scale sanitation systems, including the challenge of financing sanitation systems, wastewater and sewerage infrastructure. With the Water Safety Plans, it recommended to include sanitation into the overall concept of water and sanitation safety planning	The recommendation is fully accepted. (a) Look for additional funding opportunities to implement activities of the 2017-2019 Programme of Work of the Protocol on Water and Health, by organizing meetings with potential donors (for meeting with SOC planned in May 2018), writing letters inviting contributions (by end 2018) and inviting donors to country activities implemented under the Protocol (on-going): UNECE, WHO/Europe, Bureau of the Protocol on Water and Health, on-going efforts. (b) Develop a guidance document on sustainable financing of small-scale water supplies and sanitation: WHO/Europe, by the next session of the Meeting of the Parties in 2019	Implemented between April 2018 and November 2019 (a) Implemented. Meeting of the secretariat with the Swiss Development Cooperation Agency in June 2018, with the European Commission in October 2018 to discuss support to the implementation of the activities under the Protocol and letter sent to all Parties in April 2018 to invite financial contributions for the implementation of the 2017-2019 programme of work. (a) Implemented. Presentation of the Protocol activities at the 7th Meeting for Nordic Baltic Network for Water and Health, Uppsala, Sweden (4 Dec 2018) and bilateral discussion to prompt support to the Protocol implementation (b) Implemented. The 5th session of the Meeting of the Parties was held on 19-21 November 2019.
Environment	Strengthening Governments' and water operators' capacity ensure equity of access to water and sanitation in countries with economies in transition in the Economic Commission for Europe region, with a particular focus on small-scale water supplies and sanitation in rural areas	Mar-18	2	UNECE should consider developing additional Action Plans to ensure equitable access to water and sanitation, Water Safety Plans, amongst others. For the country missions/consultations, they should be budgeted with an additional budget for organizing a country workshop/ consultation meeting in the targeted countries and some national consultancy support (to draft a country profile). For any future similar technical cooperation programme/projects, the inclusion of a component for developing and implementing pilot projects (i.e. monitoring small-scale water supply (treatment, distribution) and small-scale sewerage/wastewater systems, Water Safety Plans in a few small-scale sites) to gain local experience would provide added value. The guidance Taking policy action to improve small-scale water supply and sanitation systems. Tools and good practices from the pan-European Region should be officially translated into other languages, such as Albanian, Armenian, Serbian. Consideration should be given to translating guidance into beneficiary country languages in future (similar) projects. UNECE should consider holding workshops, meetings in locations outside of capital cities to ensure a wider participation beyond capital cities.	The recommendation is partially accepted. (a) Follow up planning of country activities on equitable access to water and sanitation (in Serbia - Support to the development of an Equitable Access Action plan to start in July 2018, to be completed by January 2019, funded by the French Ministry of Solidarities and Health; Azerbaijan - finalization of the Equitable Access Assessment planned in May 2018, integrated and funded under on-going EUWI activities in Azerbaijan; Bulgaria - finalization of the Equitable Access Assessment planned in June 2018, funded by the French Ministry of Solidarities and Health as confirmed for 2018-2019 as well as Georgia and Belarus pending confirmation of funds - project proposal to be submitted by the NGO Women in Europe for a Common Future and UNECE by 15 May 2018 to implement activities in Georgia) and coordinate with EUWI+ project activities: UNECE (b) Implement planned actions on Water Safety Planning, pending confirmation of funds: WHO/Europe.	Implemented between July 2018 and November 2019 (a) Implemented. Serbia: Development of a regional Equitable Access Action Plan was launched on 15 August 2018; Final consultative workshop was held on 20 December 2018, Action Plan to ensure equitable access to water and sanitation in the region of Šumadija and Pomoravlje was finalized in February 2019. (a) Implemented. Azerbaijan: National equitable access assessment was finalized in July 2018 (a) Implemented. Bulgaria: National equitable access assessment was finalized in July 2018 (a) Implemented. Equitable access assessment was launched in Belarus in June 2019, in coordination with EUWI+ activities. No sufficient funds to work in Georgia. (b) Implemented. Programme of work of the Protocol on Water and Health for 2020-2022, adopted at the 5th Meeting of the Parties in November 2019, includes activities on Water Safety Planning.

Sub-Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 31 December 2019
Environment	Strengthening Governments' and water operators' capacity ensure equity of access to water and sanitation in countries with economies in transition in the Economic Commission for Europe region, with a particular focus on small-scale water supplies and sanitation in rural areas	Mar-18	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The UNECE and WHO/Europe should continue its efforts in the area of equitable access to water and sanitation/small-scale water and sanitation and continue its good cooperation with other Implementing Organizations, IFIs, donors and other stakeholders, such as the Balkan WASH network. • Increased emphasis should be placed on identifying and securing funding to finance measures, i.e. water supply, wastewater and sewerage infrastructure, which are planned in, for example Action Plans, to improve equitable access to water and sanitation. • Such project approaches as establishment of the multi-sector stakeholder engagement and twinning on the one hand, and the development of action plans and Water Safety Plans to ensure safe and equitable access to water and sanitation should be replicated in any follow-on work 	<p>The recommendation is fully accepted.</p> <p>(a) Coordinate the development of the publication "Capitalizing findings and lessons learnt from the work on equitable access to water and sanitation under the Protocol on Water and Health" including a section on Financing: UNECE to be finalized by November 2019.</p> <p>(b) Coordinate the development of the publication "Sustainable financing of small-scale water supplies and sanitation": WHO/Europe to be finalized by November 2019.</p> <p>(c) Support the implementation of the Equitable Access Action plan in Armenia (on-going), the adoption of local Equitable Access Action plans in the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia²⁷ (on-going) and in Serbia (to start in July 2018 and to be completed by January 2019)</p>	<p>Implemented in November 2019</p> <p>(a) Implemented. Publication <i>The Human Rights to Water and Sanitation in Practice: Findings and lessons learned from the work on equitable access to water and sanitation under the Protocol on Water and Health</i> in the pan-European region was adopted by the Meeting of the Parties at its 5th session in November 2019.</p> <p>(b) Implemented. Document Costing and financing of small-scale water supply and sanitation presented at the 5th session of the Meeting of the Parties in November 2019.</p> <p>(c) Implemented. In Armenia: recommendations for inclusion in the Water Code of elements of the human rights to water and sanitation discussed in October 2019 as part of the National Policy Dialogue process financed by EUWI+. In North Macedonia and in Serbia, progress made in ensuring equitable access to water and sanitation, in line with Equitable Access Action Plans (renovation of toilets in schools, building of new public toilets, new targets set...).</p>
Environment	Strengthening cooperation on water quality management in central Asia	Dec-18	2	<p>(a) It is recommended that the UNECE ensures that the Mandate for the RWG is approved by all five Central Asia countries as soon as possible by the means of both working on the policy level and supporting local experts involved in coordination with authorities.</p> <p>(b) The UNECE should put further efforts into the "incorporation" of the RWG into an officially existing and reputable interstate structure. The UNECE could also consider re-assessing the needs for establishing a separate database for water quality issues and, if the result is positive, identify a politically acceptable and technically feasible solution.</p>	<p>UNECE partially accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>Should UNECE be successful in mobilizing resources for the future project a follow up discussion with the RWG will continue to ensure the Mandate is approved. Discussions will also be held with the RWG on allocating appropriate regional platform.</p>	<p>(a) Implemented The mandate of the RWG was approved in March 2019</p> <p>(b) Closed and not implemented The issue of incorporating the RWG into officially existing interstate structure and assessment of the needs for establishing a separate database for water quality would have been considered in the framework of a future project. However, as UNECE was not successful in mobilizing resources, this proposition will not materialize, hence the recommendation is closed as of December 2019.</p>

²⁷ Name changed to the Republic of North Macedonia, effective date: 14 February 2019.

Sub-Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 31 December 2019
Environment	Implementation of the National Water and Health Targets in the Kyrgyz Republic and Tajikistan through National Policy Dialogues	Jun-19	1	It is recommended to consider a possibility of continuing support for promoting accession to the Protocol on Water and Health in the beneficiary countries and in Central Asia in general	<p>UNECE accepts the recommendation.</p> <p>UNECE continues to promote accession to the Protocol on Water and Health in Tajikistan and Kyrgyzstan, as well as also in Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan, both through organization of briefings on Protocol obligations and technical activities under the programme of work. EUWI+ programme, and the National Policy Dialogues supported under its framework, provides a platform for continuous follow up. The upcoming fifth session of the Meeting of the Parties to the Protocol (Belgrade, 19-21 November 2019) will provide another opportunity to promote accession to the Protocol among all Central Asian countries.</p>	<p>Implemented as of December 2019</p> <p>After the termination of the project, UNECE continued to promote accession to the Protocol by Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan and the countries were asked to intensify their efforts, particularly in view of the fifth session of the Meeting of the Parties to the Protocol (Belgrade, 19-21 November 2019).</p> <p>At the fifth session of the Meeting of the Parties, Tajikistan reported to be in the process of accession to the Protocol and highlighted that, while not being a Party, the country had already implemented several activities under the Protocol's framework which supported national progress on water, sanitation and health. The Meeting of the Parties welcomed this statement and encouraged Tajikistan to accelerate its efforts.</p> <p>Kyrgyzstan also attended the fifth session of the Meeting of the Parties. UNECE held a bilateral meeting with the delegation, during which it promoted accession and expressed readiness to provide technical assistance and to support the country throughout the accession process, if needed.</p> <p>Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan were also present at the fifth session of the Meeting of the Parties and reported to be considering accession to the Protocol.</p> <p>UNECE held bilateral meetings with the delegations of all Central Asian countries present at the meeting, during which it promoted accession and expressed readiness to provide technical assistance and to support the countries throughout the accession process, as needed.</p>
Environment	Implementation of the National Water and Health Targets in the Kyrgyz Republic and Tajikistan through National Policy Dialogues	Jun-19	5	It is recommended to support further activities targeted to incorporation of project results into regular government programs to ensure full sustainability	<p>UNECE accepts this recommendation.</p> <p>UNECE will continue following up on the implementation of the targets set in the context of the Protocol under the project. In addition to the accountability framework provided by the National Policy Dialogues, within the Protocol programme of work for 2020-2022, UNECE will make efforts to promote the inclusion of the targets into the national policies, strategies and programmes in both Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan</p>	<p>Implemented as of December 2019</p> <p>At the fifth session of the Meeting of the Parties, Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan reported on relevant developments happened since the termination of the project.</p> <p>Kyrgyzstan mentioned that the targets set under the Protocol will be used for the national long-term strategy on sustainable development. Kyrgyzstan also adopted two legal acts on wastewater treatment and wastewater collection, strengthening the sustainability of project results.</p> <p>Tajikistan reported on the development of the National Water Strategy. The Strategy identifies 30 flagship measures that will be promoted by the Tajik government and, amongst these, some are closely related to the revised targets developed under the project.</p> <p>UNECE is committed to follow-up on these and other relevant developments related to the incorporation of project results into regular government programs to ensure full sustainability, including within the framework of National Policy Dialogues and within the Protocol's programme of work for 2020-2022.</p>

Sub-Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 31 December 2019
Transport	ITC support to governments in climate change mitigation: lessons from the use of ForFITS tool that links policy choices and CO2 emission scenarios for inland transport	Jul-18	9	Develop an online platform for engaging the community of ForFITS users.	UNECE partially accepts the recommendation. To build the ForFITS users' community, a form will be developed to collect basic information about people downloading ForFITS on-line. Part of this information collected from interested parties will be to know the interest of users to be informed about ForFITS future evolution and to create of a contact database of users who those wishing to fill in their identity and contact details.	Implemented in September 2019 The user survey (done for users downloading the tool from May 2019) showed that half of the users downloading the tool did not wish to be informed about latest ForFITS evolution, out of 25 answers. In the foreseeable future, ForFITS Webpage will be used as a mean to show latest news and development about ForFITS. The contacts gained will built a nucleus to create a ForFITS community, as the ForFITS user survey is getting populated.
Economic Cooperation & Integration	Development and implementation of PPP international standards in support of the Sustainable Development Goals	Oct-17	1	Given the high relevance, UNECE should continue to contribute on refining universal standards in PF-PPPs.	UNECE accepts this recommendation. The UNECE has a mandate to develop international standards on People-first PPPs. The next batch of standards on urban rail, water and sanitation, a model PPP/concession law, and the impact assessment tool are expected to be presented to the Working Party on PPPs at its next session in December 2019.	This recommendation was implemented in December 2019. The standards and the model PPP law were presented to the Working Party on PPPs at its third session on 3-4 December 2019.
Economic Cooperation & Integration	Public-Private Partnerships (PPP) Initiative: PPP Toolkit and International PPP Centre of Excellence	Oct-18	6	In order to maximize the efficiency, the project management cost should be estimated and adjusted depending on the total project budget. In this case, the cost amounted to approximately 36 percent of the total project budget, a considerable level. However, for project management, staff personnel should be considered, as external consultants can cause fragmentation and diminish the institutional memory. In case staff would be too expensive compared to project size and budget, one person could manage several projects.	In order to maximize the efficiency, the project management cost should be estimated and adjusted depending on the total project budget. In this case, the cost amounted to approximately 36 percent of the total project budget, a considerable level. However, for project management, staff personnel should be considered, as external consultants can cause fragmentation and diminish the institutional memory. In case staff would be too expensive compared to project size and budget, one person could manage several projects.	This recommendation was implemented in December 2019 In September 2019, the section did a proper assessment for all future XB projects on the inclusion of a provision for temporary staff members to provide management support.
Economic Cooperation & Integration	Competitiveness, innovative policies and public-private partnerships: capacity building for civil servants and business associations (UNECE E-226)	May-19	1	In order to facilitate future evaluations, the project documents should entail (besides the established results-based-management principles) a Theory of Change, explaining how the outputs will generate outcomes and – eventually – an impact. In case this is not possible, at least a logical framework, with performance indicators, baseline values and targets both for output and outcome levels should be mandatory. This set of data will support in measuring correct performance of the project and provide realistic assessment of the relevance, effectiveness and efficiency of future similar projects (eventually sustainability could also be assessed).	A theory of change and logical framework with performance indicators, baseline values and targets will be included in future extra-budgetary projects. The project manager (Ralph Heinrich) will share the recommendation with the donor of the present project and with all professional staff in the Partnerships Development section and the Innovative Policies Development section in June 2019 to explain the need for and benefits of doing this in future projects.	Implemented as of December 2019 The project manager shared the recommendation with all professional staff in the two sections concerned and explained how including a theory of change and logical framework with baseline and target indicators in future project documents will significantly facilitate monitoring project progress during implementation and also ex-post project evaluation, thereby facilitating learning from projects and thus enhancing the quality of future projects. The project manager also shared the recommendation with the donor by e-mail and agreed to implement it in any future projects.

Sub-Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 31 December 2019
Economic Cooperation & Integration	Competitiveness, innovative policies and public-private partnerships: capacity building for civil servants and business associations (UNECE E-226)	May-19	3	Future projects should record exactly how many participants benefitted from financial support, for how long and what were the incurred costs. These data can be used to assess more appropriately the efficiency of the spent funds. On a voluntary basis, also the outcomes of the support could be traced, and a resources/results ratio could be calculated or at least approximated.	The recommendation is already being implemented in currently ongoing projects. The responsibility for implementing the recommendation will be with the respective project managers and event organizers in the Innovative Policies Development Section and the Partnership Development Section, under the responsibility of the Chiefs of Sections of the two sections.	Implemented as of December 2019 Numbers of participants benefitting from financial support and the associated costs have been recorded for all capacity building events in currently active projects. Questionnaire responses have also been collected from the participants, as well as lists of participants.
Economic Cooperation & Integration	Competitiveness, innovative policies and public-private partnerships: capacity building for civil servants and business associations (UNECE E-226)	May-19	4	UNECE should streamline gender and human rights considerations in the evaluation framework of future projects. This is more important as UNECE's work has a high potential impact on the beneficiaries, especially when considering the "people-first" PPPs.	Gender and human rights considerations will be incorporated in the theory of change, logical frameworks, performance indicators, baseline values and targets of future projects. The project manager (Ralph Heinrich) will share the recommendation with the donor of the present project and with all professional staff in the Partnerships Development section and the Innovative Policies Development section in June 2019 to explain the need for and benefits of doing this in future projects.	Implemented as of December 2019 The project manager shared the recommendation with all professional staff in the two sections concerned and explained how adding gender and human rights considerations in the theory of change and logical framework with baseline and target indicators in future project documents will ensure that projects contribute to SDG 5 on gender equality and SDG 16 on justice, peace and strong institutions. The project manager also shared the recommendation with the donor by e-mail.
Economic Cooperation & Integration	Competitiveness, innovative policies and public-private partnerships: capacity building for civil servants and business associations (UNECE E-226)	May-19	5	Future similar projects should foresee communication tools in order to communicate the project achievements in a broader way. This recommendation relates to the importance of ensuring accountability and attracting extra-budgetary funds to finance similar projects. The tools can rely on modern communication technology (blog, newsletter, webinars, databases, interactive platforms).	The project manager will share the recommendation with the staff of the Innovative Policies Development Section and the Partnerships Development Section and with the donor of the current project in June 2019. The project manager will meet with the UNECE Information Unit in June 2019 to identify ways to make communication about future project achievements more visible.	Implemented as of December 2019 The project manager shared the recommendation with all professional staff in the two sections concerned and discussed how better communication about project activities and results in future project can enhance project impact, as well as facilitating additional resource mobilization. The project manager also shared the recommendation with the donor by e-mail. The program manager and two other professional staff met with the chief of the Information Unit and one of his staff and discussed ways to make communication more visible. The Information Unit offered additional advice and support on drafting press releases, news items and tweets. More sophisticated means of communication, such as videos, would have to be produced externally subject to funds being available in future projects.

Sub-Programme	Evaluation Title	Date	No.	Report Recommendation	Management Response	Progress Report as of 31 December 2019
Economic Cooperation & Integration	Competitiveness, innovative policies and public-private partnerships: capacity building for civil servants and business associations (UNECE E-226)	May-19	7 a	UNECE could re-think some of the events organized in the region. While the nature of (semi)official meetings needs to maintain an etiquette (for governmental representatives), at least for practitioner's "warm-up" activities could be considered. During a two-days standard event, participants break the ice by the time when the event is over. The participants' fluctuation prevents from creating informal networks. Hence an online database of "who's-who" could be created, in order to facilitate networking in the region.	<p>The recommendation does not specify which activities could be used to "break the ice". In the experience of UNECE, coffee breaks, event dinners and small-group break-out sessions can be used for this purpose.</p> <p>In future projects, hospitality budgets will be included subject to donor agreement. Tours de table for participants to introduce each other will be included in all capacity building events. Small group breakout sessions with report-back will be included where feasible, i.e. where there are no language barriers or where additional interpretation can be provided as necessary.</p> <p>To implement the recommendation is ongoing work. The responsibility falls within the remit of the Innovative Policies Development Section and the Partnerships Development Section.</p>	<p>Implemented as of December 2019</p> <p>Tours de table have been held at all capacity building events in 2019. Hospitality has been provided at most events, sometimes through pro bono contributions by host organizations. A small group interactive training on innovation policy was held in March 2019 back to back with the annual session of the Committee on Innovation and Competitiveness Policies with 10 participants from Central Asia and the Caucasus and in cooperation with UNCTAD. The feedback from the participants was positive, and a similar but larger event is planned for the Southern Balkans in the first quarter of 2020.</p>
Trade	Strengthening national capacities of the CIS countries to implement ECE agricultural quality standards (E236)	Sep-18	1	The UNECE needs to finalise negotiating with the Shushary lab about disposing the equipment, e.g. by transferring ownership to the Shushary laboratory according to the UN rules and regulations.	The secretariat accepts the recommendation. The transfer of the equipment to the Shushary lab, in accordance with the UN Financial Rules and Regulations, will be completed by 30 June 2019.	<p>Implemented in September 2019.</p> <p>The transfer documents have been received signed in September 2019 and this activity is fully completed and closed.</p>
Trade	Strengthening national capacities of the CIS countries to implement ECE agricultural quality standards (E236)	Sep-18	5	It is recommended that a practical guide/brochure be developed by the Shushary lab outlining the lab concept, list of equipment, its application, capacity building activities (trainings, conferences, etc.), lessons learnt, etc. for broad dissemination and placement on the web site). UNECE secretariat or individual technical experts who have been involved in the project are encouraged to participate, to increase likelihood of impact of the project and create opportunities for showcase this work and translate it to other projects/regions/ etc. showcase effects and increase impact.	The secretariat partially accepts the recommendation. The secretariat will convey the recommendation to the Shushary laboratory. However, this being outside the scope of the United Nations, UNECE can only recommend the said action to the Shushary laboratory.	<p>Implemented in December 2019.</p> <p>The UNECE has informed the Shushary laboratory of the recommendation and indicated the willingness of the secretariat to support such work provided that sufficient funds can be identified. The secretariat provided the names of ECE experts who would have the expertise for supporting such work and the Shushary laboratory is working with Dr Lê, ECE's main consultant for the laboratory project.</p>